



Scotland Learning



# AROUND SCOTLAND

**Spring 2009**

Mondays 11.40–12.00

*19 January to 2 February*

BBC 2

## **The Jacobites**

### **Curriculum for Excellence**

These notes relate to re-transmitted programmes, and were conceived within the 5–14 framework. While the 5–14 terminology has been retained, teachers are encouraged to consider the content in terms of its contribution to promoting successful learners, confident individuals, responsible citizens and effective contributors.



# **Around Scotland**

**Spring 2009**

**The Jacobites**

Introduction	3
Programme 1 <b>Ye Jacobites by name</b>	4
Programme 2 <b>Charlie is my darling</b>	11
Programme 3 <b>Over the sea to Skye</b>	18

# The Jacobites

## Introduction

Programme One introduces the premise of the series – the same historical event will be presented from two opposing points of view, and the children will have to weigh the evidence and decide for themselves what they believe actually happened.

Programme One is presented as a series of sections, each supported by maps and short live action re-enactments. It presents the Hanoverian point of view, then is rounded off by Gavin Mitchell asking questions that appear to cast doubt on the presenter's views.

Gavin Mitchell then recaps at the beginning of the following two programmes to remind pupils of the theme of the series. Programme Two is presented by a Jacobite supporter whose presentation takes the form of a location based broadcasts, and Programme Three looks at the historical evidence and hears from archaeologists and historians.



*The presenters of The Jacobites:  
left to right in photo are Kirsten Coulter-Smith, Gavin Mitchell and Tony Close.*

## Programme One **Jacobites by name**

— Transmission date Monday 19 January 2009

### Programme synopsis

Programme One is presented by a Hanoverian supporter, who is studio-based. It is broken down into the following sections.

#### **The song *Ye Jacobites By Name***

The presenter comments on the use of the image of Bonnie Prince Charlie, usually framed in tartan, on Scottish souvenirs and tourist products.

#### **The Young Pretender**

He then questions Bonnie Prince Charlie's right to be called Scottish and his image as a hero. He explains how King James was ousted from power because of his Catholic sympathies.

#### **Hanoverians**

Hanoverians were invited to form a Protestant government. The Old Pretender and the Young Pretender began to plot to get their kingdom back.

#### **Jacobites?**

The name Jacobite comes from the word *Jacobus*, the Latin form of James. The presenter claims that the Jacobites were backward-looking and unable to accept the new Protestant order. They were believers in the Divine Right of Kings and would not recognise the rule of Parliament.

#### **Motivation**

As factors behind the Jacobite movement, the presenter cites

- people who disliked the union with England and desired independence,
- people who hated having a foreign king, and preferred the Stuarts because they were British,
- the desire of some Irish people to avenge their treatment by the English Protestant army, and
- the fact that the French were already at war with Britain, and would like another front to be opened up.

The presenter claims that the Young Pretender promised to give these different groups what they wanted in order to get them to work together to restore the Stuarts to the throne.

#### **London**

London was essential to Bonnie Prince Charlie's bid to take the throne because it was the economic and political powerhouse of the government. Its capture would bring wealth and important communication links.

#### **Plan A or Plan B**

Plan A involved landing the Young Pretender and a French invasion fleet in the south of England and capturing London. A storm scattered the fleet and the British navy was alerted to the plan. The invasion was called off.

Plan B involved the Young Pretender arriving in Scotland with two ships (the *Du Teillay* and the *Elisabeth*), 700 men and few weapons. The ships were attacked by the British navy and the *Elisabeth* was so badly damaged that it returned to France.

### **Highland Welcome?**

The Young Pretender arrived in the north of Scotland with one ship, no weapons and seven followers. He was advised by the clan chiefs that met him that any military action would certainly fail and the consequences would be grim for his followers. Many clan chiefs did not come to support him.

### **The Young Pretender**

The Pretender encouraged the clan chiefs who did turn out to meet him with claims that there would be further support from Scotland, England and France. (He continued to make these claims all through the campaign.) On August 19th 1745 he raised his standard at Glenfinnan

### **Britain failed to cope**

The initial success of the campaign was due to the failure of the British government to cope because most of its forces were in Europe fighting the French, rather than to good leadership on the part of the rebellion leaders. Meeting no heavy artillery or cavalry, the army moved south quickly and had their first major victory at Prestonpans. This stunned the British government and they brought troops from Europe to deal with the rebellion.

### **The Chase**

Inspired by his success, the Young Pretender persuaded his commanders to invade England. There were a number of British armies moving around Britain in search of the rebels. The Duke of Cumberland, the 24 year old son of George II, was brought back from Flanders to take command of one of these armies.

### **The Young Pretender**

The Young Pretender's forces moved from Edinburgh to Carlisle, Manchester and Derby, trying to attract more English supporters as they went, but they never gathered the numbers they had hoped for. At Derby the rebel leaders were led to believe that the Duke of Cumberland's army was close by. An English spy told them that there was second English army in the area. The rebels also realised that the promised French support was not going to materialise.

### **Go North**

Against the Prince's wishes, a decision was taken to retreat north. The dream of a quick entry into London was over. During the retreat there was a Jacobite victory at Falkirk, but the retreat continued.

### **Falling Apart**

All the towns that the rebels had taken on their journey south fell back into the hands of the Hanoverian armies. This prevented the Jacobites from using them as a source of soldiers and supplies. The Jacobites were losing heart — they were unpaid, and short of food and supplies. The Duke of Cumberland's army was well fed and supplied, and now had special training in fighting the Jacobites.

### **Culloden**

Against the advice of his commanders, especially the experienced Lord George Murray, the Young Pretender decided to make his stand at Culloden. The ground was not suited to the Jacobite style of fighting. The Duke of Cumberland used his cannons and the new style of fighting, jabbing bayonets to the right, to achieve a clear victory. He gave the order that 'No Quarter' was to be given to the wounded or captured Jacobites, either on the battlefield or off it.

### Running Away

The following day some 3000 Jacobites gathered at Ruthven Barracks to wait for the arrival of the Young Pretender, but he never arrived. Instead, he sent word that every man should 'save himself as best he could. He also said that any money left in the Jacobite coffers should be forwarded to him. After months of hiding in the heather and 'behind the skirts of women' the Young Pretender escaped by boat to France.

### Victory

The Hanoverian government severely punished the rebels, to discourage the Highlanders from ever again rising. As he rode into London, the Duke of Cumberland was hailed by cheering crowds for his suppression of the rebellion. The composer Handel wrote a piece of music — *See the Conquering Hero Comes* — in celebration of the event.

## Programme coda

Gavin Mitchell finishes with two questions that seem to cast doubt on some of what the Hanoverian presenter said. He asks

- Was Bonnie Prince Charlie nothing more than a coward?
- Wasn't the Duke of Cumberland nicknamed the Butcher?

## Key vocabulary

Words in bold type are used the programme. The other words are useful for explaining the concepts being taught.

bias    **the Divine Right of Kings**    **fact**    historian    **opinion**    oral tradition  
          **propaganda**    primary sources    secondary sources    **sources**    **symbol**

## Before the programme

Ask the children, working either individually or in pairs, to write down as much information as they can about Bonnie Prince Charlie and note information they would like to know about him. A KWL grid would be ideal for this. The children can then feed their work back to the class and their statements can be categorised as either fact or opinion. Talk with the children about where their information came from (for example, did someone tell them, did they learn it from a documentary, did they see it in a feature film, did they read it in a book?). Explain that historians use oral tradition, primary sources of evidence and secondary sources of evidence. Discuss the differences between these sources.

Explain to the children that they are going to watch a programme about Bonnie Prince Charlie, but that it will be presented from the Hanoverian point of view. They will be asked to differentiate between facts and opinions in the presenter's view of characters and events of the '45.

Talk about the differences between fact and opinion, using statements like 'United is the best football team in the world', and 'United are number one in the league'. Make sure the pupils understand that facts can be proved while opinions are personal beliefs that cannot.

The children should be given Worksheets 1 and 2 prior to watching the programme. Complete the first question on Worksheet 1 and then watch the programme so that they are aware of bias in what the Hanoverian presenter says. The children should work in pairs, deciding who will listen for what information and take notes during the programme.

## Follow-up activities

- 1 Complete Worksheet 1 questions 2, 3 and 4 using the notes taken during the programme. This could be done in pairs or as a whole class activity.
- 2 Complete Worksheet 1 question 5 on *Ye Jacobites By Name*. Resource sheet 1 gives the words of the song.
- 3 Complete Worksheet 1 question 6 using a dictionary or the website  
<http://dictionary.reference.com>
- 4 Complete Worksheet 2 questions 1–5 using the notes taken during the programme. This could be done in pairs or as a whole class activity.
- 5 Have a class brainstorming session on reasons why Bonnie Prince Charlie is still such a popular symbol today. Children can then write about this phenomenon giving their own views on the reasons.
- 6 Children could create a Hanoverian ‘wanted’ poster for the Young Pretender using a variety of media.
- 7 Children could write and deliver a news bulletin about the approach of the Jacobite army to Derby, and then present a follow-up bulletin about the retreat from the town.

### Ye Jacobites by Name

- 1  
Ye Jacobites by name, lend an ear, give an ear!  
Ye Jacobites by name, lend an ear,  
Ye Jacobites by name,  
Your faults I will proclaim,  
Your doctrines I maun blame — you shall hear!
- 2  
What is Right, and what is Wrang, by the law, by the law?  
What is Right, and what is Wrang, by the law?  
What is Right, and what is Wrang?  
A short sword and a lang,  
A weak arm and a strang, for to draw!
- 3  
What makes heroic strife, famed afar, famed afar?  
What makes heroic strife famed afar?  
What makes heroic strife ?  
To whet th' assassin's knife,  
Or hunt a Parent's life, wi bluidy war!
- 4  
Then let your schemes alone, in the State, in the State!  
Then let your schemes alone, in the State!  
Then let your schemes alone,  
Adore the rising sun,  
And leave a man undone, to his fate!



## Bonnie Prince Charlie: witness for the prosecution Part 1

- 1 The presenter of programme is a supporter of the Hanoverians so we must expect his information to be biased. How will that affect what he says and how we think about it?

---

---

- 2 Listen carefully to the presenter and list some of the negative words and phrases he uses to describe Charles Edward Stuart.

---

---

After you have watched the programme, go back and circle any of the words you wrote down that you think the presenter proved were historically accurate.

- 3 Use a dictionary to help you write down three definitions of the word 'pretender'.

1 

---

---

2 

---

---

3 

---

---

- 4 Highlight the definition Charles Edward Stuart would apply to himself. Highlight in a different colour the definition the presenter is using. Explain the difference.

---

---

- 5 Look carefully at the words of 'Ye Jacobites By Name'.  
How is this song anti-Jacobite propaganda?

---

---

---

- 6 This song is a **primary** / **secondary** historical source.  
Score out the wrong answer and explain your reasoning.

---

---

## Bonnie Prince Charlie: witness for the prosecution Part 2

1 Why was it important for the Jacobites to take London?

1 \_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
2 \_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_

2 Why did the Highland chiefs not want to progress to London?

1 \_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
2 \_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
3 \_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_

3 Why did Charles Edward Stuart want to continue to London?

1 \_\_\_\_\_  
2 \_\_\_\_\_  
3 \_\_\_\_\_

4 Who do you think was correct? Why?

\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_

5 Culloden is often portrayed as a battle between the Scots and the English but that is an oversimplification. Match the groups with the reasons that they may have been fighting for the Jacobite cause. There may be more than one answer for a group.

Highland Scots •	• <i>revenge for their treatment by the English army</i>
Irish •	• <i>orders from the clan chiefs</i>
French •	• <i>dislike for the union of parliaments, desire for independence</i>
English •	• <i>dislike of foreign king</i>
Lowland Scots •	• <i>religion</i>
	• <i>to support the fight against the British army in Europe</i>

6 If, as the presenter claims, the Young Pretender was a calculating, deceitful and inept young man, why is his story still celebrated on tea towels and shortbread tins?

\_\_\_\_\_

## Programme Two **Charlie is my darling**

— Transmission date Monday 26 January 2009

### Programme synopsis

At the beginning of the programme Gavin Mitchell recaps the premise of the series. The programme is then presented by a Jacobite supporter, whose presentation takes the form of location based broadcasts.

The song *Charlie is My Darling* is heard as she begins her journey. She explains that the chevalier mentioned in the song is a brave, honest nobleman and this is what Bonnie Prince Charlie was, and more. The Prince first landed on Eriskay disguised as an English clergyman and was carried ashore on the back of a Highlander. When he met local chiefs they were not optimistic about the rising since he had brought no army, no weapons and no money to raise either. He was advised to go home. 'I am come home, sir', he replied.

In August 1744 he reached Moidart to an enthusiastic Highland welcome. At Kinlochmoidart house he made plans and announced that in five days time he would raise his standard at Glenfinnan. Meanwhile in London the government became aware that something was going on.

The Prince arrived with the Seven Men of Moidart of whom four were Irish, one was English and two were Scots. He was at the mercy of circumstance. Could he, by daring action, force the French into providing more support? The standard was raised on the 19th August 1744 by the Duke of Atholl, one of the Seven Men of Moidart. By the end of the day he had one thousand men standing with him. The only Hanoverian force strong enough to fight him was led by General Sir John Cope. Without enough Hanoverian forces to defend them, the roads and bridges built under the supervision of General Wade now proved useful to the Jacobites as they headed south.

Bonnie Prince Charlie knew that most of his forces were there at the order of their clan chiefs, who were well educated and lived in style. Many of them spoke Greek and Latin. There was a strong Highland tradition of bearing arms for your chief. The Highlanders spoke Gaelic, and the Prince set out to prove his worth by marching alongside them and learning their language. The Highlanders had a strong moral code which would not allow the murder of wounded soldiers or non-combatants.

The Duke of Atholl had lost his home, Blair Castle, and his title because of his Jacobite sympathies. They had gone to his Hanoverian brother. Now, with the Jacobite force, he reached the home that he had not seen for thirty years.

The Jacobite forces forded the Forth at Frew, near Kippen. Bonnie Prince Charlie led the charge against the Hanoverian soldiers defending the crossing, and the Hanoverians fled to Stirling. Bonnie Prince Charlie bypassed Stirling and its Castle and headed for Linlithgow which also quickly fell to him.

The presenter comments on the fact that Bonnie Prince Charlie had Scottish ancestors while George II had no British connection and even had difficulty speaking English.

Bonnie Prince Charlie then headed for Edinburgh, which he approached via Arthur's Seat, staying out of the way of the castle guns. He took up residence at Holyrood Palace. The town leaders had a problem. They were not Jacobite supporters but there was no Hanoverian army nearby and Bonnie Prince Charlie was on the doorstep. They tried stalling for time, but on the night of 16th September 1744 the Jacobites took one of the city gates and by morning the city was under Jacobite control.

General Cope landed at Dunbar with 2,500 men. The forces met at Prestonpans. The battle lasted fifteen minutes because of the effectiveness of the Highland charge which left five hundred Hanoverian soldiers dead and fourteen hundred taken prisoner. The victory was due to the military tactics of Lord George Murray, who had been recruited to the Jacobites force at Perth.

At this point the presenter surveys the site of the battle of Prestonpans, and notes that the sites of important historical events like battles often change dramatically due to the passing of time and the needs of the people in the area.

For the next five weeks, the Prince held a royal court at Holyrood. He gathered new recruits. Money, cannon and soldiers arrived from France. The union with England was declared ended and the national debt rejected. However, the Prince refused to order any celebrations because of the slaughter at Prestonpans.

The Jacobites headed south again. The Prince wanted to go via Newcastle to halt the supply of coal to London but his commanders recommended taking Carlisle. The siege of Carlisle lasted a week and then the city fell. As winter set in the Jacobites took Manchester, but instead of raising a thousand troops, as they had hoped, they raised only two hundred and fifty.

Lord George Murray was continuing to use his skills to avoid the two government armies that were hunting for the Jacobites. The Jacobite army walked into Derby unopposed. An advance party of cavalry took the bridge before Hanoverians could destroy it. The road south was open. London was only one hundred and thirty miles away.

Although there were large Hanoverian forces in England, none were nearby. Yet the Jacobite commanders refused to advance further. They had no official news of further support via an invasion force from France. A Hanoverian spy, Captain Dudley Bradstreet, had managed to gain their confidence and persuade them that another Hanoverian army was about to trap them if they didn't withdraw northwards at once. The Prince was horrified at their decision but there was nothing he could do.

The Prince spent Christmas in the Borders at Dumfries. A week later he held a full review of his army on Glasgow Green. His army had grown by a further four thousand troops. The Hanoverian General Holly was in Edinburgh with an army of eight thousand men. They were building gallows. Early in the new year, while the Prince was staying at Bannockburn house, he fell ill. While there, he also met Clemintina Walkinshaw who later gave birth to his only child, Caroline.

Stirling fell to the Jacobites but the castle held out, leading to a time-wasting siege that ended in failure. Then the Jacobites faced General Holly at Falkirk. They defeated Holly, and four hundred wounded Hanoverian soldiers with all their equipment were left on the field. After this victory, and in the midst of a bitter winter, the Jacobite commanders decided to withdraw further north. There were more local successes including Ruthven Barracks, Inverness Castle and Fort Augustus. But a French ship carrying urgently needed aid from France, including twelve thousand pounds and badly needed supplies, was driven ashore by the British navy and all the cargo was lost.

Then came the slaughter of Culloden. A famished, exhausted army was mown down by the Duke of Cumberland's artillery. After the battle, the Prince travelled through the Highlands for five months fleeing from the pursuing Hanoverians. Despite having a reward of thirty thousand pounds on his head, no-one betrayed him. Of all the people who helped him at this time, none is better known than Flora MacDonald of Armadale on Skye. She brought the Prince from the Long Island to Skye dressed as Betty Burke, an Irish serving-maid.

On the 19th September 1746, the Prince and about a hundred of his followers boarded two French ships and returned to France. Once there, the Prince immediately began to make plans for his return but the French king distanced himself from the Stuart cause and the plans all came to nothing. Forty-one years later the Prince died in the arms of his daughter in Rome

## Key vocabulary

Words in bold type are used the programme. The other words are useful for explaining the concepts being taught.

bias    **civil war**    **the Divine Right of Kings**    **fact**    **opinion**    **prejudice**  
**propaganda**    primary sources    secondary sources    **sources**

## Before the programme

Ask the children, working either individually or in pairs, to write down as much information as they can about Bonnie Prince Charlie and note any information they would like to know about him. If they used a KWL grid for the preparation of Programme One, they can continue to work on that.

Explain to the children that they are going to watch a second programme about Bonnie Prince Charlie, but this time from the Jacobite point of view. They will be asked to differentiate between facts and opinions in the presenter's view of characters and events of the '45. Revise with the children the difference between fact and opinion.

The children should be given Worksheets 3 and 4 prior to watching the programme. Complete the first question on Worksheet 3 and then watch the programme so that they are aware of bias in what the Jacobite presenter says. The children should work in pairs, deciding who will listen for what information and take notes during the programme.

## Follow-up activities

- 1 Complete Worksheet 3 question 2 using a dictionary or the website  
<http://dictionary.reference.com>
- 2 Complete Worksheet 3 question 3 on *Charlie is My Darling*. Resource sheet 2 gives the words of the song.
- 3 Have a class brainstorming session on reasons why the outside filming adds to the impact of what the Jacobite presenter is saying. Talk about the way that she frequently uses the title Bonnie Prince Charlie. Is this propaganda?
- 4 Complete Worksheet 3 question 5 using a dictionary or the website  
<http://dictionary.reference.com>
- 5 Have a class brainstorming session on ideas that Bonnie Prince Charlie's might use to justify raising his standard and precipitating the '45. Complete the first part of question 6 on Worksheet 3. Then have a class 'brainshower' session on the Hanoverian response. This could be developed into a drama activity with half the class developing speeches as Bonnie Prince Charlie and the other half as the Hanoverian government.
- 6 Complete Worksheet 4 question 1 using a dictionary or the website  
<http://dictionary.reference.com>
- 7 Use the website  
[http://www.bbc.co.uk/history/british/civil\\_war\\_revolution/launch\\_ani\\_bonnie\\_prince.shtml](http://www.bbc.co.uk/history/british/civil_war_revolution/launch_ani_bonnie_prince.shtml)  
 and other reference sources to answer Worksheet 4 question 2. As a class, discuss the attitude of Bonnie Prince Charlie towards the prisoners at Prestonpans ('they are my father's subjects') and the 'No quarter' order of the Duke of Cumberland at Culloden. Raise the issues of prejudice and racism.

- 8 Ask the class to discuss Worksheet 4 question 3 in pairs and feed their thoughts back to the rest of the class. Children can then choose what they believe to be the strongest reasons and write them down.
- 9 Ask the class to discuss Worksheet 4 question 4 in pairs and feed their thoughts back to the rest of the class. Children can then choose what they believe to be the strongest reason and highlight it.
- 10 Ask the children to use research materials to create labelled diagrams of both a Highlander and a redcoat. These could be done as small figures or as full size figures, using a variety of media.

## Charlie is My Darling

1 Twas on a Monday morning  
Right early in the year  
When Charlie came to our town  
The Young Chevalier

*Chorus Charlie is my darling, my darling, my darling  
Charlie is my darling, the young Chevalier*

2 As he cam' marchin' up the street  
The pipes played loud and clear  
And a' the folk cam' rinnin' out  
To meet the Chevalier

3 Wi' highland bonnets on their heads  
And claymores bright and clear  
They cam' to fight for Scotland's right  
And the young Chevalier

4 They've left their bonnie highland hills  
Their wives and bairnies dear  
To draw the sword for Scotland's lord  
The young Chevalier

5 Oh, there were many beating hearts  
And mony a hope and fear  
And mony were the pray'rs put up  
For the young Chevalier

## Bonnie Prince Charlie: witness for the defence Part I

- 1 The presenter of programme is a supporter of the Jacobites so we must expect her information be biased. How will that affect what she says and how we think about it?

---

---

- 2 The presenter calls what happened 'romantic'. Write a definition of what she means by this word.

---

---

---

- 3 Look carefully at the words of 'Charlie is My Darling'.  
How is this song pro-Jacobite propaganda?

---

---

---

- 4 How does the Jacobite presenter add to the impact of what she is saying by using outside broadcasts? How does it differ from the Hanoverian presenter's style?

---

---

---

- 5 Write a definition of the Divine Right of Kings in your own words.

---

---

- 6 How would Charles Edward Stuart justify his arrival in Scotland and his determination to take the throne using the Divine Right of Kings?

---

---

---

How would the Hanoverians refute this?

---

---

---



## Bonnie Prince Charlie: witness for the defence Part 2

- 1 Culloden is often portrayed as a battle between the Scots and the English, but that is an oversimplification. The Jacobite cause split families and set brother against brother. This is called a civil war. Write a definition of civil war.

---

---

Why is civil war often called the worst type of war?

---

---

- 2 How did Bonnie Prince Charlie's treatment of prisoners after the battle of Prestonpans differ from the treatment of the Jacobites at the hands of the Duke of Cumberland after Carlisle was retaken and after the battle of Culloden?

---

---

Why was the treatment so different?

---

---

---

- 3 After the defeat at Culloden and the treatment of the Highlanders at the hands of the Duke of Cumberland and his troops, why do you think no-one betrayed Bonnie Prince Charlie for either the £30,000 reward or the favour of the Hanoverian government? How do you justify your answer?

---

---

---

- 4 Highlight who you think is most responsible for the failure of the rebellion.

The French, *for failing to supply sufficient men and equipment*

Bonnie Prince Charlie, *because of his bad leadership*

The clan chiefs, *for refusing to march on London*

The Duke of Cumberland, *for defeating the Jacobites at Culloden*

The Highlanders, *for failing to win at Culloden*

Explain your answer.

---

---

## Programme Three **Over the sea to Skye**

— Transmission date Monday 2 February 2009

### **Programme synopsis**

Gavin Mitchell interviews an archaeologist, Jill Harden, at the site of the battle of Culloden. She tells him that new archaeological evidence has shown that the old view of where and how the battle was fought was wrong. She explains how they had been using documents and maps as their main sources of information the battle but the physical evidence has proved some of these to be wrong. She shows him some musket balls and paints a strong image of how they were used and the damage they might have caused.

Gavin Mitchell then interviews two Jacobite re-enactors who explain where they get their information about the replica weapons they use. They explain what the targe was made from and how it was used in battle. They also demonstrate the Highlanders' way of fighting using the targe, dirk and basket sword. The error of choosing Culloden as the site of the battle is shown — the state of the ground was poor at the time, and the terrain did not suit the Highlanders' way of fighting.

The next interview is with two dragoons. They explain how, before Culloden, the redcoats were trained in fighting with bayonets to counteract the Highland charge. The dragoons also give their justification for the treatment of the Jacobite wounded and prisoners after the battle.

Gavin Mitchell then goes to Ruthven Barracks to ask historian Doreen Grove whether the Jacobite Cause was dead after Culloden. She says that it probably was, because the goal of the Prince was to rule Britain, and for that he needed to capture London. His failure to do so left the Jacobite supporters feeling disappointed and angry. Gavin also wants to find out how effective the Barracks and other forts were at policing the Highlands. The historian feels that the Jacobite successes were due more to luck than tactics.

Next Gavin visits Stirling to find out why it is geographically and tactically so important. Historian John Harrison explains that it is due to where it is sited in relation to two ranges of hills as well as the north and south of Scotland, and it controlling the lowest bridging point of the Forth at that time. He discusses the pros and cons of Charles Edward Stuart remaining in Stirling after the Battle of Falkirk rather than travelling to Inverness.

Dr. Louise Yeoman explains to Gavin the differences in attitude to Jacobite supporters between Edinburgh and the Highlands. Jacobites in Edinburgh would probably have been left alone, while those in the Highlands were subjected to genocide and ethnic cleansing. Their treatment was different because they were perceived differently, and their situation was aggravated by the fact that they were already living close to subsistence level.

Louise Yeoman gives her view of Bonnie Prince Charlie and the '45 and compares it to previous risings. There was no widespread support for a political system that was seen as old-fashioned. She believes that Charles Edward Stuart was a misguided, flawed character who, because of his upbringing, dined with people's lives.

The last section of the programme shows children where they can look for information when they are doing their own research. Sources includes local museums and the National Library of Scotland and its website. If possible, children should try to visit the actual sites of the events they are researching, to gain first-hand knowledge and understanding of the practical implications of the landscape. They should also question the documents they use, and develop an awareness of the bias and vested interest that may be implicit in the material.

Gavin Mitchell closes the programme by concluding that history is much more than a set of facts to be learnt.

## Key vocabulary

Words in bold type are used the programme. The other words are useful for explaining the concepts being taught.

archaeologist    artefact    bias    culture    **ethnic cleansing**    fact  
genocide    **historian**    opinion    primary sources    propaganda  
secondary sources    sources    symbol

## Before the programme

Once again, ask the children, working either individually or in pairs, to write down as much information as they can about Bonnie Prince Charlie and note information they would like to know about him. If they used a KWL grid for the preparation of Programme One, they can continue to work on that.

Explain to the children that they are going to watch a third programme about Bonnie Prince Charlie but this time from an archaeologist's and historian's point of view. The children should be aware that, as archaeologists and historians, these presenters should be unbiased — but they should still listen closely, just in case!

The children should work in pairs, deciding who will listen for what information and take notes during the programme.

## Follow-up activities

- 1 Complete Worksheet 5 question 1 on the *Skye Boat Song*. Resource sheet 3 gives the words of the song.

- 2 Complete Worksheet 5 question 2 using a dictionary or the website

<http://dictionary.reference.com>

- 3 Complete Worksheet 5 question 3 using notes and a dictionary or the website

<http://dictionary.reference.com>

Discuss with the pupils how it would feel to hold objects from the time. Can the children describe the emotions it would evoke.

- 4 Worksheet 5 question 4-6 can be completed using notes taken during the programme.

- 5 Worksheet 6 question 1 can be completed with notes from the programme.

- 6 Complete Worksheet 6 question 2 using a dictionary or the website

<http://dictionary.reference.com>

and notes from the programme.

- 7 Worksheet 6 questions 3 and 4 raise the issues of prejudice, racism and ethnic cleansing of people regarded as inferior. Can the children cite other instances? The treatment of Native Americans is touched on in the programme.

- 8 Children could create a mind map of what makes them individual, unique human beings. Based on their mind map, they could draw up a list of elements that are important to their individuality. Have a class discussion about what would happen if these elements became illegal or led to persecution. How would that make the children feel as individuals or a social group? This could lead to a poetry-based creative writing exercise.

- 9 Have a class brainstorming session on arguments for and against the Jacobite cause and Bonnie Prince Charlie. Ask children to work in groups to draw up arguments in support of or against the Prince. They can then present their arguments, with supporting evidence, to say whether he was a hero or a villain. Hold a court, with a judge and counsels presenting their arguments with appropriate evidence. Then have a secret ballot about whether the children would support the Jacobite or Hanoverian cause.

## Extension activities

- 1 Have a class discussion about the issues of bias and prejudice that have been raised in the programme.
- 2 Once the children have completed their KWL grids, they can think about how their perception of Bonnie Prince Charlie has changed over the period of watching the programmes. Do they feel disappointed because their illusions have been shattered? Or do they now see him as all the more human and therefore all the more interesting?
- 3 Discuss the relevance of history to modern Scotland. Does the '45 have any bearing on life today? Use the article in the Scotsman at

<http://news.scotsman.com/uk.cfm?id=641642006>

about the link between Culloden and the anthem BBC chose for their programme on the World Cup. Ask whether this is something we should be concerned about. Isn't it just an irrelevant event that happened a long time ago?

- 4 Ask the pupils to try to track down maps of the battle of Culloden and Ruthven Barracks using the web site of the National Library of Scotland.  
 ([www.nls.uk](http://www.nls.uk) → home page → collections → maps → view map images →  
 → military maps of Scotland (18th century) → themes: battles → Culloden  
 and  
[www.nls.uk](http://www.nls.uk) → home page → collections → maps → view map images →  
 → military maps of Scotland (18th century) → themes: fortifications → Ruthven)
- 5 Talk about how these maps are primary sources, and examine the meaning and the importance of primary sources.
- 4 Look at pictures and maps of Stirling Castle, and discuss why it is so strategically important. What practical considerations would you have to consider before siting a castle?
- 5 When considering sources, what kind of questions should you be asking yourself about the material?

## Skye Boat Song

*Chorus*      *Speed bonnie boat, like a bird on the wing,  
Onward, the sailors cry  
Carry the lad that's born to be king  
Over the sea to skye*

1              Loud the winds howl, loud the waves roar,  
Thunder clouds rend the air;  
Baffled our foe's stand on the shore  
Follow they will not dare

*Chorus*      *Speed bonnie boat....*

2              Though the waves leap, soft shall ye sleep  
Ocean's a royal bed  
Rocked in the deep, Flora will keep  
Watch by your weary head

*Chorus*      *Speed bonnie boat....*

3              Many's the lad fought on that day  
Well the claymore could wield  
When the night came, silently lay  
Dead on Culloden's field

*Chorus*      *Speed bonnie boat....*

4              Burned are our homes, exile and death  
Scatter the loyal men  
Yet, e'er the sword cool in the sheath,  
Charlie will come again.

*Chorus*      *Speed bonnie boat....*

## Hero or Villain (or something in between)? You the jury Part I

1 What song is played over the opening credits? \_\_\_\_\_

Look carefully at the words. Is this song pro- or anti-Jacobite? Explain your answer.

---



---

2 Write a job description for an archaeologist.

---



---

3 What kind of physical evidence has been found on the Culloden battlefield?

What special name is given to found objects like these? \_\_\_\_\_

How does seeing these objects help in our understanding of historical events?

---



---

4 Match the objects to their descriptions. Some might match more than one. Remember to use a ruler and use a different colour for each line!

<i>targe</i> •	• <i>has a cage-like handle that can be used for both attack and defence</i>
<i>dirk</i> •	• <i>for defence</i>
<i>basket sword</i> •	• <i>dagger-like steel weapon attached to the barrel of a gun</i>
<i>bayonet</i> •	• <i>used in a slashing motion</i>
	• <i>for attack</i>

5 Describe the sequence of fighting actions of the Highlanders.

1 \_\_\_\_\_

2 \_\_\_\_\_

3 \_\_\_\_\_

4 \_\_\_\_\_

6 Describe the new fighting style of the government army.

---



---

Why did this fighting style require more discipline?

---



---

## Hero or Villain (or something in between)? You the jury Part 2

- 1 Match      *'We should fight on the hills.'* •                      • *Charles Edward Stuart*  
                  *'We should fight on the flat'* •                      • *Lord George Murray*
- 2 Explain the consequences of 'Give no quarter' on the battlefield of Culloden.

---



---

Give two reasons why this command may have been given:

1 

---

2 

---

- 3 What were the consequences for Jacobites living in Edinburgh after Culloden?

---



---

- 4 What were the consequences for Jacobites living in the Highlands after Culloden?

1 

---

2 

---

3 

---

4 

---

5 

---

Why were the Highlanders treated with such brutality?

---



---

Find the word or the two word phrase that describes this kind of action.

g \_ \_ \_ \_ \_ or e \_ \_ \_ \_ \_ c \_ \_ \_ \_ \_

- 5 On a separate piece of paper write down ten things that make you YOU. (Think about family, language, where you stay, friends, beliefs and so on.) Choose the top three and write them here.
- 6 After Culloden, many things including tartan, the bagpipes, the Gaelic language, and basket swords were banned in the Highlands. What were the Hanoverians trying to do to Highland culture?

---



---